Economic growth, living standards and productivity in Tasmania

Presentation to Tasmanian Leaders Program

Technopark, Dowsings Point
11th March 2010

Saul Eslake
Program Director – Productivity Growth
Grattan Institute
Warning!

There is no electoral comment in this presentation!
The past decade has seen Tasmania enjoy relatively better overall economic growth than the 1990s …

Growth in real gross State product (GSP)

Nine years to 1999-2000

Nine years to 2008-09

Source: ABS State Accounts (5220.0) 2008-09
… significantly faster employment growth …

Source: ABS Australian Demographic Statistics Quarterly (3101.0).
... significantly faster growth in employment ...

Growth in employment

Nine years to 2000-01

Nine years to 2008-09

Source: ABS The Labour Force (6202.0).
… and much lower unemployment, both in absolute terms and relative to the mainland

Source: ABS The Labour Force (6202.0).
Tasmania’s public finances are also in much better shape – even with the deficits incurred since the onset of the financial crisis.

Tasmanian State government finances

- ‘General government’ net debt
- ‘General government’ fiscal balance
- Net interest expense as a p.c. of revenues
- ‘General government’ capital expenditures

Note: Data are for financial years ended 30 June. Data on the ‘fiscal balance’ (the accrual-based measure of the budget bottom line) is not available for years before 1998-99. Forward estimates are from the February 2010 Mid-Year Review of the 2009-10 Budget estimates.

Source: Tasmanian State Budget Papers and 2009-10 Mid-Year Review.
Despite these improvements Tasmanians are in most respects less well off than people in other States and Territories.

**Median gross household income**

$ per week (2007-08)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Median Gross Household Income</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NSW</td>
<td>1000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vic</td>
<td>1250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qld</td>
<td>1500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>1750</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA</td>
<td>2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tas</td>
<td>2500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NT</td>
<td>3000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACT</td>
<td>3500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**National average**

**Access to employment**

% of working-age (15+) population (2008-09)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Access to Employment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NSW</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vic</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qld</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tas</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NT</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACT</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**National average**

**Median household net worth**

$ '000 (2005-06)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Median Household Net Worth</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NSW</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vic</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qld</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA</td>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tas</td>
<td>700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NT</td>
<td>800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACT</td>
<td>900</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**National average**

**Long-term unemployment**

% of unemployed out of work for > 1 year (2008-09)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Long-term Unemployment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NSW</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vic</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qld</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tas</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NT</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACT</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**National average**

Source: ABS, Household Income and Income Distribution (6523.0); The Labour Force (6202.0); and Australian Social Trends (4102.0).
Tasmanians experience shorter and in some respects less full lives than people in other States and Territories.

**Life expectancy: men**

- Years (2005-07)
- National average
- NSW, Vic, Qld, SA, WA, Tas, NT, ACT

**Persons with a disability**

- % of working-age (15+) population (2008-09)
- National average
- NSW, Vic, Qld, SA, WA, Tas, NT, ACT

**Life expectancy: women**

- Years (2005-07)
- National average
- NSW, Vic, Qld, SA, WA, Tas, NT, ACT

**Persons of low socio-economic status**

- % of population living in areas with low socio-economic status, 2006-09
- National average
- NSW, Vic, Qld, SA, WA, Tas, NT, ACT

Sources: ABS Social Trends (4102.0); Commonwealth Grants Commission, Report on GST Revenue-Sharing Relativities – 2010 Review.
Relatively more children grow up in disadvantageous circumstances in Tasmania than in other States

Teenage mothers

Births to mothers < 20 as % of total, 2008

National average

Children in single-parent families

% of children under 15 in one-parent households (2008)

National average

No acknowledged father

% of all births, 2008

National average

Children living in jobless households

% of children < 15 living in families where no resident parent is employed (2007-08)

National average

Source: ABS Social Trends (4102.0).
Tasmanian households are less connected to the digital world than households elsewhere in Australia

Households without access to a computer at home, 2008-09

Households without access to the internet at home, 2008-09

Source: ABS, Household Use of Information Technology (8146.0) 2008-09.
Tasmania’s most fundamental economic problem is its persistently low level of productivity

Labour productivity (gross product per hour worked), 2008-09

Tasmanian labour productivity as a pc of Australian average

Source: ABS State Accounts (5220.0) 2008-09; and The Labour Force, Australia, Detailed, Quarterly (6291.0.55.003); and Grattan Institute calculations.
Productivity matters …

“Productivity isn’t everything – but in the long run it’s almost everything”


“Productivity is the prime determinant in the long run of a nation’s standard of living, for it is the root cause of per capita national income. High productivity not only supports high levels of income but allows citizens the option of choosing more leisure instead of working longer hours.

It also creates the national income that is taxed to pay for public services which again boosts the standard of living.

The capacity to be highly productive also allows a nation’s firms to meet stringent social standards which improve the standard of living, such as in health and safety, equal opportunity and environmental impact”

There’s a strong correlation between productivity and per capita incomes

Labour productivity and per capita income, 2008-09

Source: ABS State Accounts (5220.0) 2008-09; and The Labour Force, Australia, Detailed, Quarterly (6291.0.55.003).
Tasmania’s low level of productivity means that relatively low labour costs are not the ‘comparative advantage’ that they might seem.

**Labour costs per hour worked**

**2008-09**

![Graph showing labour costs per hour worked by state for 2008-09.](image)

**Labour costs per $100 of goods & services produced**

![Graph showing labour costs per $100 of goods & services produced by state for 2008-09.](image)

*Sources: ABS State Accounts (5220.0) 2008-09; and The Labour Force, Australia, Detailed, Quarterly (6291.0.55.003); and Grattan Institute calculations.*
Tasmania’s low level of productivity partly reflects a below-average representation of high-productivity industries (and vice-versa) …

**Labour productivity by industry - Australia, 2008-09**

- Mining
- Finance & insurance
- Electricity gas & water
- Rental, hiring & real estate
- Information, media & telecoms
- Wholesale trade
- All industries
- Manufacturing
- Admin & support services
- Transport, postal & warehousing services
- Public administration & safety
- Professional, scientific & technical services
- Construction
- Agriculture, forestry & fishing
- Health care & social assistance
- Education & training
- Art & recreation services
- Retail trade
- Accommodation and food services

**Share of gross value added by industry, 2008-09**

- Mining
- Finance & insurance
- Electricity gas & water
- Rental, hiring & real estate
- Information, media & telecoms
- Wholesale trade
- Manufacturing
- Admin & support services
- Transport, etc services
- Public admin & safety
- Prof'l, scntfc & tech svces
- Construction
- Agriculture, forestry & fishing
- Health care etc
- Education & training
- Art & recreation services
- Retail trade
- Accommodation and food services

**Sources:** ABS: Australian System of National Accounts (5204.0) and State Accounts (5220.0), and Grattan Institute calculations.
… and partly reflects below-average productivity in a majority of Tasmania’s industries

Tasmanian labour productivity by industry
as a proportion of national industry average, 2008-09

Sources: ABS : Australian System of National Accounts (5204.0) and State Accounts (5220.0), and Grattan Institute calculations.
Productivity growth comes from three major sources

- Investment in physical and ‘intangible’ capital
  - plant and equipment, buildings and structures
  - software, intellectual property

- Investment in ‘human’ capital
  - skills and education of the workforce
  - formal (institution-based) and on-the-job learning

- Innovation
  - new products
  - new ways of producing existing products
  - new ways of organizing and managing existing processes
Tasmanian businesses appear to have been more willing to engage in innovation than businesses in most other States and Territories.

**Business innovation, by State and Territory – 2008-09**

**New goods or services**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State/Territory</th>
<th>% of all businesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NSW</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vic</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qld</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tas</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NT</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACT</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

National average: 17

**New operational processes**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State/Territory</th>
<th>% of all businesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NSW</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vic</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qld</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tas</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NT</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACT</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

National average: 17

**New organizational or managerial processes**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State/Territory</th>
<th>% of all businesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NSW</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vic</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qld</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tas</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NT</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACT</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

National average: 17

**New marketing methods**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State/Territory</th>
<th>% of all businesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NSW</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vic</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qld</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tas</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NT</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACT</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

National average: 17

Relatively high levels of fixed capital investment tend to be associated, over time, with high levels of labour productivity.

Labour productivity and per capita income by State and Territory

Source: ABS State Accounts (5220.0) 2008-09; and Grattan Institute calculations.
Tasmania invests a smaller proportion of its income than most other States and Territories.

Fixed capital investment as a pc of gross product, 2008-09

Business investment as a pc of gross product, 1994-95 to 2008-09

Source: ABS State Accounts (5220.0) 2008-09
There’s a strong correlation between levels of educational attainment in the work force and labour productivity.

**Labour productivity and educational attainment, 2008-09**

Source: ABS State Accounts (5220.0) 2008-09; Survey of Education and Work (6227.0) May 2009.
A smaller proportion of the Tasmanian workforce has post-school qualifications than that of any other State or Territory.

Proportion of persons aged 25-64 with post-school qualifications

By State and Territory, 2008

Tasmania and Australia, 1998-2008

Source: ABS Social Trends (4102.0).
Tasmanian adults have, on average, lower literacy and life skills than the national average

Source: ABS, Adult Literacy & Life Skills Survey, Summary Results 2006 (4228.0)
There’s still too few Tasmanian school children completing secondary school

Apparent school retention rates, Years 7/8 to Year 12

By State and Territory, 2008

Tasmania and Australia, 1998-2008

Source: ABS Social Trends (4102.0).
A slightly higher proportion of Tasmanian year 3 school children are achieving at or below national minima than the national average ...

% of Year 3 students at or below minimum NAPLAN standards, 2009

**Numeracy**

- National average

**Writing**

- National average

**Reading**

- National average

**Spelling**

- National average

**Grammar & punctuation**

- National average

*Note: These charts show the proportion of school children achieving at or below the national minimum benchmark for each ‘domain’; hence, crudely, ‘the lower the figure the better’.*

... and in most ‘domains’ the proportion of Tasmanian children achieving below benchmark has widened relative to the national average by Year 9.

% of Year 9 students at or below minimum NAPLAN standards, 2009

**Numeracy**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domain</th>
<th>NSW</th>
<th>Vic</th>
<th>Qld</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>WA</th>
<th>Tas</th>
<th>NT</th>
<th>ACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% at or below national minimum standard</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Writing**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domain</th>
<th>NSW</th>
<th>Vic</th>
<th>Qld</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>WA</th>
<th>Tas</th>
<th>NT</th>
<th>ACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% at or below national minimum standard</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Reading**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domain</th>
<th>NSW</th>
<th>Vic</th>
<th>Qld</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>WA</th>
<th>Tas</th>
<th>NT</th>
<th>ACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% at or below national minimum standard</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Spelling**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domain</th>
<th>NSW</th>
<th>Vic</th>
<th>Qld</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>WA</th>
<th>Tas</th>
<th>NT</th>
<th>ACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% at or below national minimum standard</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Grammar & punctuation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domain</th>
<th>NSW</th>
<th>Vic</th>
<th>Qld</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>WA</th>
<th>Tas</th>
<th>NT</th>
<th>ACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% at or below national minimum standard</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: These charts show the proportion of school children achieving at or below the national minimum benchmark for each ‘domain’; hence, crudely, ‘the lower the figure the better’.

A below-average proportion of Tasmanians are employed in high-skill occupations, and an above-average proportion in low-skill ones.

**Graph 1: Percentage of workforce employed in highest-skill occupations, 2008-09**

**Graph 2: Percentage of workforce employed in lowest-skill occupations, 2008-09**

*Source: ABS, Labour Force, Australia, Detailed, Quarterly (6291.0.55.003)*
Immigration contributes less to Tasmania’s skill base than it does that of most other States and Territories.

Skilled immigrants as a p.c. of total settler arrivals

By State and Territory, 2008

Tasmania and Australia, 1998-2008

Source: Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, Settler Arrivals.
Interstate migration patterns are (probably) detracting from Tasmania’s skill base and (certainly) speeding up the ageing of Tasmania’s population.

Sources: ABS Demographic Statistics Quarterly (3101.0); Grattan Institute calculations.
Tasmania’s population is older than, and ageing more rapidly than, that of any other State or Territory.

Source: ABS, Population by Age and Sex (3102.0), Population Projections, Australia, 2006-2101 (3222.0)
### Four insights from a McKinsey study published this month

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Insight</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Productivity of individual sectors matters more than ‘sector mix’</strong></td>
<td>- the strongest-performing sectors vary from region to region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- what above regions have in common is that their largest sectors (whatever they are) maintain strong growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Services sector productivity and competitiveness is critical</strong></td>
<td>- services sectors have accounted for almost all net jobs growth in high-income countries over the past two decades</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Government policies can strongly influence productivity and competitiveness in sectors not directly exposed to international trade or global competition</strong></td>
<td>- regulation that facilitates business entry tends to increase competition and productivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- flexible hiring laws and part-time employment arrangements correlate with higher employment and more rapid adjustment to change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Competitiveness in ‘new innovative sectors’ is not enough to boost economy-wide employment and growth</strong></td>
<td>- these sectors are too small to make a difference to economy-wide growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- access to talent and favourable demand conditions are more important than tax incentives or direct government involvement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: McKinsey Global Institute, How to Compete and Grow: A Sector Guide to Policy (March 2010)*
... cannot possibly lie predominantly in the volume production of essentially unprocessed commodities at lower prices than competitors with better access
  - to larger and cheaper resources of labour and capital
  - and to markets (by virtue of proximity of membership of trade blocs)

... but instead depends on its capacity to produce and market
  - highly differentiated goods and services
  - embodying a relatively high intellectual content
  - for which customers are willing to pay premium prices
An agenda for lifting Tasmanian productivity and incomes

- A sustained effort to improve the quantity and quality of Tasmanian education
  - lifting year 12 retention rates to mainland levels
  - curriculum reform
  - closing the school performance gap with the mainland
  - challenging entrenched beliefs that higher levels of education aren’t necessary

- Extending and upgrading of Tasmanian infrastructure
  - with particular emphasis on transport, communications, water and ‘clean’ energy

- Seeing structural change as an opportunity, not a threat
  - much more skeptical approach towards propping up ‘old’ industries
  - positive attitude towards competition and new businesses
  - abandon the ‘cargo cult’ approach to large industrial projects

- Capitalizing on – rather than resisting – advances in knowledge
  - (for example) abandoning bans on GM technologies

- Seeing the ‘Tasmanian diaspora’ as an asset, not a loss
  - making much better use of Tasmanians living and working on the mainland or overseas as ambassadors and champions